

On the Controversies over German Narratives of Romantic Opera in the Twentieth Century

Diau-Long SHEN

Abstract

The historiography of the German Romantic opera is a largely ignored topic today. However, its elucidation of the multifold intellectual debates on the relationships between German music and German national identity among international academicians makes it worthy of investigation. The discourse of German Romantic opera within the German-speaking community reveals how those debates are shaped and addressed. In this essay, the author analyzes the writings of pre- and post-World War II works by Siegfried Goslich (1937, 1975), Carl Dahlhaus (1983, 1984), Sabine Henze-Döhring and Sieghart Döhring (1997), which are representative not only of their individual narrative methods but also of their sequential “problem-solution” exposition. Through the lens of these German-speaking musicologists, this paper explicates how the conceptions of German Romantic opera narratives break through a nationalistic framework by veering toward the “history of ideas” in composition technique, and then achieve a historiography of transnational fluidity and connectivity over the course of the twentieth century.

Keywords: German Romantic opera, nationalism, history of ideas, narrative in music historiography, transnational

關於二十世紀的浪漫歌劇 德語敘事爭議

沈雕龍

摘 要

本論文探討一個近來較被忽略的音樂史書寫面相：德語浪漫歌劇的歷史書寫。這個議題的價值在於讓我們認識到，從二次大戰之後，德國音樂和其國族身份認同如何在國際知識圈中引發了一波波激烈的爭議；而本文呈現這些爭議如何被指認出來，又如何在德語音樂學圈中的德語浪漫歌劇歷史書寫變化裡被逐步化解。我分析了二戰前和二戰後，勾斯利希（Siegfried Goslich, 1937, 1975）、達爾豪斯（Carl Dahlhaus, 1983, 1984）、亨策－德林和德林（Sabine Henze-Döhring and Sieghart Döhring, 1997）等人的相關作品；這些歷史書寫作品各自採用的敘事方法，不僅對於本文要指出的爭議具有代表性，更重要的是，這些書寫之間呈現出一種連續性的「問題與解決」關係。從這些橫貫二十世紀的歷史書寫中可以看出，德語圈音樂學家對德語浪漫歌劇的敘事手法從國族主義的框架，變遷到作曲技巧的「觀念史」，最後轉向跨國性的流動和連結。

關鍵詞：德語浪漫歌劇、國族主義、觀念史、音樂史書寫敘事法、跨國性

Bibliography

I. Sources

- Dahlhaus, Carl. "Die romantische Oper als Idee und als Gattung." In *Jahrbuch der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen*, 1984, 52-64. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1984.
- . *Foundations of Music History*. Translated by J. Bradford Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Originally published as *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte* (Cologne: Hans Gerig, 1977).
- . "Webers *Freischütz* und die Idee der romantischen Oper." In *Carl Dahlhaus Gesammelte Schriften*, vol. 7, *19. Jahrhundert IV*, edited by Hermann Danuser, 612-620. Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 2004.
- . "Romantische Oper und symphonischer Stil." In *Carl Dahlhaus Gesammelte Schriften*, vol. 7, *19. Jahrhundert IV*, edited by Hermann Danuser, 621-636. Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 2004.
- Döhring, Sieghart. "Giacomo Meyerbeer: Grand opéra als Ideendrama." *lendemains* 31/32 (1983), 11-22.
- Döhring, Sieghart, and Sabine Henze-Döhring. *Oper und Musikdrama im 19. Jahrhundert*. Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1997.
- Henze-Döhring, Sabine. "Einleitung." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 1-10.
- . "Transformation der Gattung im Spiegel des 'romantismo': Bellini – Donizetti – Mercadante." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 28-40.
- . "Ein Singspiel aus dem Geist der Restauration: Beethovens *Fidelio*." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 91-95.
- . "Das Singspiel und die Idee des 'Romantischen'." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 96-109.
- . "Die Großen Opern Wagners." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 164-179.

- Döhring, Sieghart. "Musikdrama: Entstehung und Konzeption von Wagners *Ring des Nibelungen*." In Döhring and Henze-Döhring, *Oper und Musikdrama*, 257-281.
- Goslich, Siegfried. *Beiträge zur Geschichte der deutschen romantischen Oper zwischen Spohrs "Faust" und Wagners "Lohengrin"*. Leipzig: Kistner and Siegel, 1937.
- . *Die deutsche romantische Oper*. Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1975.

II. Secondary Literature

- Applegate, Celia. "How German Is It? Nationalism and the Idea of Serious Music in the Early Nineteenth Century." *19th-Century Music* 21, no. 3 (Spring 1998): 274-296.
- Applegate, Celia, and Pamela Potter. "Germans as the 'People of Music': Genealogy of an Identity." In *Music and German National Identity*, edited by Celia Applegate and Pamela Potter, 1-35. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2002.
- Betz Wieser, Thomas. *Sprechen und Singen: Ästhetik und Erscheinungsformen der Dialogoper*. Stuttgart: J.B. Metzler, 2002.
- Bohlman, Philip V. "Ontologies of Music." In *Rethinking Music*, edited by Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist, 17-34. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- . *Focus: Music Nationalism, and the Making of the New Europe*. 2nd ed. New York: Routledge, 2011.
- Döhring, Sieghart. "Review: Siegfried Goslich, *Die deutsche romantische Oper*." *Die Musikforschung* 35, no. 2 (April-June 1982): 191-193.
- E. B. "Review: *Beiträge zur Geschichte der deutschen romantischen Oper zwischen Spohrs 'Faust' und Wagners 'Lohengrin'* by Siegfried Goslich." *Music & Letters* 19, no. 3 (July 1938): 354-355.
- Eggebrecht, Hans Heinrich. *Zur Geschichte der Beethoven-Rezeption*. Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1994.

- Fend, Michael. “‘Es versteht sich von selbst, daß ich von der Oper spreche, die der Deutsche und Franzose will ...’: Zum Verhältnis von Opéra comique und deutscher romantischer Oper.” In *Die Opéra comique und ihr Einfluß auf das europäische Musiktheater im 19. Jahrhundert: Bericht über den Internationalen Kongreß Frankfurt 1994*, edited by Herbert Schneider and Nicole Wild, 299-322. Hildesheim: Olms, 1997.
- Garlington, Jr., Aubrey S. “Review: *Die deutsche romantische Oper* by Siegfried Goslich.” *The Musical Quarterly* 62, no. 4 (October 1976): 603-607.
- . “German Romantic Opera and the Problem of Origins.” *The Musical Quarterly* 63, no. 2 (April 1977): 247-263.
- Garratt, James. “Review: *Music and German National Identity* edited by Celia Applegate and Pamela Potter; *Carl Maria von Weber and the Search for a German Opera* by Stephen C. Meyer.” *Music & Letters* 85, no. 2 (May 2004): 285-295.
- Goehr, Lydia. “Writing Music History.” *History and Theory* 31, no. 2 (May 1992): 182-199.
- Goslich, Siegfried. “Review: Edward J. Dent, *The Rise of Romantic Opera*, edited by Winton Dean.” *Die Musikforschung* 33, no. 1 (January-March 1980): 76-77.
- Gregor, Neil, and Thomas Irvine. Introduction to *Dreams of Germany: Musical Imaginaries from the Concert Hall to the Dance Floor*, edited by Neil Gregor and Thomas Irvine, 1-29. New York: Berghahn, 2019.
- Hoffmann, E. T. A. *Schriften zur Musik: Aufsätze und Rezensionen*. Munich: Winkler, 1978.
- . *Die Serapions-Brüder*. Munich: Winkler, 1978.
- Jones, Gaynor G. “Review: *Die deutsche romantische Oper* by Siegfried Goslich.” *Notes* 33, no. 1 (September 1976): 63-65.
- Levi, Erik. *Music in the Third Reich*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1994.
- Maehder, Jürgen. “Review: Siegfried Goslich, *Die deutsche romantische Oper*.” In *Aurora: Jahrbuch der Eichendorff-Gesellschaft*, vol. 38, edited by Wolfgang Frühwald, Franz Heiduk, and Helmut Koopmann, 194-196. Würzburg: Eichendorff-Gesellschaft, 1978.

- Osterhammel, Jürgen. *The Transformation of the World: A Global History of the Nineteenth Century*. Translated by Patrick Camiller. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2014.
- Potter, Pamela M. "Musicology under Hitler: New Sources in Context." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 49, no. 1 (Spring 1996): 70-113.
- Reiber, Joachim. "Wie romantisch ist die romantische Oper? Literaturgeschichtliche Überlegungen zu einem Problem der deutschen Operngeschichte." In *Leitmotive: Kulturgeschichtliche Studien zur Traditionsbildung. Festschrift für Dietz-Rüdiger Moser*, edited by Marianne Sammer, 307-319. Kallmünz: Laßleben, 1999.
- Sakai, Naoki. "Theory and Asian Humanity: On the Question of *Humanitas* and *Anthropos*." *Postcolonial Studies* 13, no. 4 (2010): 441-464.
- Shen, Diau-Long. "Composer-Critic and 'Inimitable Creator': E. T. A. Hoffmann, W. A. Mozart, and the Genesis of German Romantic Opera." In *Nineteenth-Century Music Criticism*, edited by Teresa Cascudo, 403-419. Turnhout: Brepols, 2017.
- Sieb, Rainer. "Der Zugriff der NSDAP auf die Musik: Zum Aufbau von Organisationsstrukturen für die Musikarbeit in den Gliederungen der Partei." PhD diss., Osnabrück University, 2007.
- Wagner, Richard. *Das Kunstwerk der Zukunft*. Leipzig: Otto Wigand, 1850.
- Wolff, Christoph. "Die Hand eines Handlangers: 'Musikwissenschaft' im Dritten Reich." In *Entartete Musik: Zur Düsseldorfer Ausstellung von 1938. Eine kommentierte Rekonstruktion*, edited by Albrecht Dümmling and Peter Girth, 93-94. Düsseldorf: Der Kleine Verlag, 1988.

Diau-Long SHEN

Diau-Long SHEN received his PhD from Freie Universität Berlin (Germany). Currently he teaches as assistant professor of musicology at the Department of Music of the National Tsing Hua University (Hsinchu, Taiwan, R.O.C.). His research focuses on German Romantic opera, the historiography of music, the oral history of music, and the Cold War and music.

沈雕龍，柏林自由大學音樂學博士，現為國立清華大學音樂學系助理教授。研究範圍包括德語浪漫歌劇、音樂史書寫、音樂口述史、冷戰與音樂。