

運用「整合性音樂素養」畫出 國中音樂課程的實踐藍圖

黃靜芳

摘 要

本研究運用「整合性音樂素養」(Comprehensive Musicianship, 以下簡寫為 CM) 於國中音樂課程, 旨在規劃 CM 音樂課程設計、探討 CM 教師教學歷程與分析 CM 學生學習表現。課程主題「動手玩音樂」下設計三個單元: 動手玩燈光秀、動手 DIY 卡祖笛、動手做創作曲, 採用行動研究法於 4 個七年級班級循環教學, 參與者為七年級學生 116 位、研究者本人與國中原班音樂教師, 收集資料包括學生問卷回饋單、教師教學省思、教師觀課紀錄與教學錄影, 透過三角檢證效度, 提出綜合省思與結論: 1. 在音樂課程設計上 CM 具有統整音樂要素、體驗音樂角色與活化學習策略的特色; 2. 在教師教學歷程上 CM 注重充足探索時間、強化創作引導、重視班級經營; 3. 在學生學習表現上 CM 能提升學習動機、體會美感經驗與學到帶得走能力。

關鍵詞: 整合性音樂素養、音樂課程、教學歷程、學習表現、行動研究

*本篇文章為音樂教育領域, 採用 APA 格式。

Using Comprehensive Musicianship to Draw the Practical Blueprint on Junior High School Music Curriculum

Ching-Fang HUANG

Abstract

This study investigates Comprehensive Musicianship (CM) in a junior high school curriculum in order to research into the design of CM music curriculum, establish the pedagogical procedures of teachers, and analyze learning performance of students. Three lessons under the Play Music by Hands Curriculum were inserted into the regular music class, namely music light show, kazoo DIY, and music composition. Action research was adopted for four-cycle music curricula. Participants in this project include: 116 seventh graders at junior high school, their music teacher, and the researcher. Data were collected from questionnaires done by the students, teaching reflections, teaching records and videos. Triangulation was utilized to present findings. The conclusions are as follows: First, regarding music curriculum design, CM is conducive to integrate musical elements, experiencing music roles, and diversifying learning strategies. Second, regarding teaching procedures, teachers who apply CM pay attention to allowing students sufficient time to explore, encouraging students' motivation to compose, and reinforcing class management to help students learn deeply. Third, regarding students' learning performance, CM students demonstrate greater motivation for learning, have better aesthetic experience, and acquire more application competencies.

Keywords: Comprehensive Musicianship, music curriculum, teaching process, learning performance, action research

* This article, written on the subject of music education, uses APA format.

參考文獻

一、英文文獻

- Abeles, H. F., Hoffer, C. R., & Klotman, R. H. (1994). *Foundations of music education* (2nd ed.). New York: Schirmer Books.
- Brahms, J. (1869). *Hungarian dance no. 5*. Retrieved from <https://toplayalong.com/sheet-music/brahms-hungarian-dance-no-5-violin>
- Burton, L. (2021). Comprehensive musicianship—The Hawaii music curriculum project. *Visions of Research in Music Education, 16*, Article 35. Retrieved from <https://opencommons.uconn.edu/vrme/vol16/iss1/35>
- Center for Collaborative Action Research. (2021). Tutorial 10: Cycles of change. Activities. *Action Research Tutorials*. Retrieved from <https://www.actionresearchtutorials.org/10-activities>
- Choksy, L., Abramson, R. M., Gillespie, A. E., Woods, D., & York, F. (2001). *Teaching music in the twenty-first century* (2nd ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Goodlad, J. I. (1979). *Curriculum inquiry: The study of curriculum practice*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Hanley, B., & Montgomery, J. (2002). Contemporary curriculum practices and their theoretical bases. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (Eds.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 113-143). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Jorgensen, E. R. (2002). Philosophical issues in curriculum. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (Eds.), *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 48-62). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lune, H., & Berg, B. L. (2017). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences* (9th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Mark, M. L. (1996). *Contemporary music education* (3rd ed.). New York: Schirmer Books.

- Phelps, R. P., Ferrara, L., & Goolsby, T. W. (1993). *A guide to research in music education* (4th ed.). London: Scarecrow Press.
- Pike, P. D. (2013). Profiles in successful group piano for children: A collective case study of children's group-piano lessons. *Music Education Research, 15*, 92-106. doi:10.1080/14613808.2012.754416
- Reimer, B. (1989). *A philosophy of music education* (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Reimer, B. (2003). *A philosophy of music education: Advancing the vision* (3rd ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Sindberg, L. K. (2016). Elements of a successful professional learning community for music teachers using comprehensive musicianship through performance. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 64*, 202-219. doi:10.1177/0022429416648945
- Temple, M. (2019). Teaching comprehensively. *Illinois Music Educator, 79*(3), 37-39.
- Thomson, W. (2021). The anatomy of a flawed success: Comprehensive musicianship revisited. *Visions of Research in Music Education, 16*, Article 23. Retrieved from <https://opencommons.uconn.edu/vrme/vol16/iss1/23>
- Warner, R. W. (2021). CM reflections of a band director. *Visions of Research in Music Education, 16*, Article 29. Retrieved from <https://opencommons.uconn.edu/vrme/vol16/iss1/29>
- Willoughby, D. (2021). Comprehensive musicianship. *Visions of Research in Music Education, 16*, Article 28. Retrieved from <https://opencommons.uconn.edu/vrme/vol16/iss1/28>
- Yoo, H., & Kang, S. (2017). Teaching the Korean folk song (*Arirang*) through performing, creating, and responding. *General Music Today, 31*(1), 16-25. doi:10.1177/1048371317705163

二、中文文獻

- 王文科、王智弘。(2020)。《教育研究法》(第19版)。臺北：五南。
- 【Wang, W.-K., & Wang, C.-H. (2020). *Educational research methods* (19th ed.). Taipei: Wunan.】
- 王郁菁。(2009)。《「整合性音樂素養教學」運用於學齡前兒童音樂學習成效之研究》(國立臺灣師範大學碩士論文)。
- 【Wang, Y.-C. (2009). *A study on the learning effectiveness of applying the comprehensive musicianship approach to preschoolers' music lessons* (Master's thesis, National Taiwan Normal University).】
- 丘永福、余昕晏、李其昌(主編)。(2019)。《國民中學藝術課本》(第1冊, 1上)。臺北：康軒文教。
- 【Chiu, Y.-F., Yu, H.-Y., & Li, C.-C. (Eds). (2019). *Junior high school art textbook* (Vol. 1, first semester of first grade). Taipei: Kang Hsuan Educational.】
- 包威爾。(2017)。《好音樂的科學Ⅱ：從古典旋律到搖滾詩篇—看美妙樂曲如何改寫思維、療癒人心》(柴婉玲譯)。臺北：大寫。
- 【Powell, J. (2017). *Why you love music: From Mozart to Metallica—The emotional power of beautiful sounds* (W.-L. Chai, Trans.). Taipei: Briefing Press.】
- 朱彥霖。(2005)。《「整合性音樂基本能力模式」應用於國小五年級學生音樂學習之研究》(臺北市立師範學院碩士論文)。
- 【Chu, Y.-L. (2005). *A study of applying comprehensive musicianship to 5th-grade elementary school students for music learning* (Master's thesis, Taipei Municipal Teachers College).】
- 吳木崑。(2009)。〈杜威經驗哲學對課程與教學之啟示〉。《臺北市立教育大學學報：教育類》40(1), 35-54。doi:10.6336/JUTe/2009.40(1)2
- 【Wu, M.-K. (2009). The insights of John Dewey's empirical philosophy for curriculum and teaching. *Journal of Taipei Municipal University of Education: Education*, 40(1), 35-54. doi:10.6336/JUTe/2009.40(1)2】
- 卓甫見。(2013)。〈整合性音樂基礎訓練面面觀〉。《藝術學報》93, 237-262。

【Cho, F.-C. (2013). A study of the aspects of comprehensive musicianship. *Journal of National Taiwan College of Arts*, 93, 237-262.】

林小玉。(2020)。〈音樂教學法之我見我思：以整合性音樂素養為例〉。收錄於郭芳玲（主編），《對話：台灣奧福教育協會第 14 屆專刊》（第 51-62 頁）。臺中：臺灣奧福教育協會。

【Lin, S.-Y. (2020). Some observation and thoughts on music pedagogies: Taking comprehensive musicianship for example. In F.-L. Kuo (Ed.), *In dialogue: The 14th premium edition of Taiwan Orff-Schulwerk Association* (pp. 51-62). Taichung: Taiwan Orff-Schulwerk Association.】

林小玉、朱彥霖。(2006)。〈「整合性音樂基本能力」模式之內涵與在大學音樂基礎訓練課程上之應用〉。收錄於陳曉霽（主編），《2006 音樂教育學術研討會：音樂教學法之理論與實務論文集》（第 161-181 頁）。臺北：國立臺灣師範大學音樂學系。

【Lin, S.-Y., & Chu, Y.-L. (2006). The connotation of the “comprehensive musicianship” model and its application in the university music basic training courses. In H.-F. Chen (Ed.), *The proceedings of music education symposium 2006: On the theories and practices of music pedagogies* (pp. 161-181). Taipei: Department of Music, National Taiwan Normal University.】

林怡妙。(2015)。《運用綜合音樂素養於長笛團體課之教學歷程與學習成效》（國立臺南大學碩士論文）。

【Lin, Y.-M. (2015). *The teaching process and learning outcomes of applying comprehensive musicianship to group flute class* (Master's thesis, National University of Tainan).】

教育部。(2018)。《十二年國民基本教育課程綱要：國民中小學暨普通型高級中等學校，藝術領域》。檢索自 <https://reurl.cc/436OxR>

【Ministry of Education. (2018). *Curriculum guidelines of 12-year basic education: Elementary, junior high schools and general senior high schools, the arts domain*. Retrieved from <https://reurl.cc/436OxR>】

教育部。(2021)。《十二年國民基本教育課程綱要：總綱》。檢索自 <https://reurl.cc/QjneGo>

- 【Ministry of Education. (2021). *Curriculum guidelines of 12-year basic education: General guidelines*. Retrieved from <https://reurl.cc/QjneGo>】
- 畢恆達。(2020)。《教授為什麼沒告訴我：2020 進化版》。新北：小畢空間。
- 【Bih, H.-D. (2020). *Why professors didn't tell me that: Ver. 2020*. New Taipei: Bih Space.】
- 郭芳秀(2016)。《應用「整合性音樂素養」於國小藝術才能音樂班五年級合唱課之行動研究》(國立臺灣師範大學碩士論文)。
- 【Kuo, F.-H. (2016). *An action research of applying comprehensive musicianship to choral class for 5th-grade elementary music talented class* (Master's thesis, National Taiwan Normal University).】
- 陳姿光。(2019)。〈「整合性音樂素養」理念運用於流行音樂產業系一年級理論課程之個案研究〉。《清華教育學報》36(2), 43-90。doi:10.6869/THJER.201912_36(2).0002
- 【Chen, T.-K. (2019). Applying “comprehensive musicianship” to the freshman theory curriculum of music industry majors. *Tsing Hua Journal of Educational Research*, 36(2), 49-90. doi:10.6869/THJER.201912_36(2).0002】
- 單文經。(2020)。〈在十二年國教課綱「總綱」中遇見杜威〉。《當代教育研究季刊》28(2), 1-29。doi:10.6151/CERQ.202006_28(2).0001
- 【Shan, W.-J. (2020). Meeting John Dewey in the directions for curriculum guidelines of 12-year basic education. *Contemporary Educational Research Quarterly*, 28(2), 1-29. doi:10.6151/CERQ.202006_28(2).0001】
- 鈕文英(2007)。《教育研究方法與論文寫作》。臺北：雙葉書廊。
- 【Niew, W.-I. (2007). *On educational research methods and thesis composition*. Taipei: Yeh Yeh Book Gallery.】
- 黃靜芳。(2020)。〈音樂與自然科學的美妙相遇—從自製樂器開展的跨領域美感教學〉。《臺灣教育評論月刊》9(11), 45-54。
- 【Huang, C.-F. (2020). The beautiful encounter between music and natural science: The interdisciplinary aesthetics teaching developed from DIY musical instruments. *Taiwan Educational Review Monthly*, 9(11), 45-54.】
- 葉重新。(2017)。《教育研究法》(第三版)。新北：心理。

【Yeh, C.-H. (2017). *Educational research methods* (3rd ed.). New Taipei: Psychological.】

蔡清田。(2013)。《教育行動研究新論》。臺北：五南。

【Tsai, C.-T. (2013). *Action research in education*. Taipei: Wunan.】

蕭麗珊。(2017)。《運用整合性音樂素養理念於國小五年級音樂教學》(國立臺南大學碩士論文)。

【Hsiao, L.-S. (2017). *Applying comprehensive musicianship into fifth grade general music classes* (Master's thesis, National University of Tainan).】

鍾欣韻。(2018)。《運用整合性音樂素養於國小四年級音樂教學之行動研究》(國立臺南大學碩士論文)。

【Chung, H.-Y. (2018). *An action research of integrating comprehensive musicianship in fourth grade general music classes* (Master's thesis, National University of Tainan).】

Using Comprehensive Musicianship to Draw the Practical Blueprint on Junior High School Music Curriculum

Ching-Fang HUANG

Summary

The music curriculum of 12-Year Basic Education Curriculum Guidelines emphasizes learning core competency, which encompasses knowledge, ability, and attitude that students should possess to equip themselves to tackle daily life matters and face future challenges. Equally important to the concept of core competency is that learning should incorporate real-life scenarios and enhance holistic development through action. Students learn integrated knowledge rather than fragmented and irrelevant theory fed through memorization. To a great extent, the idea of core competency corresponds to that of Comprehensive Musicianship.

Comprehensive Musicianship, abbreviated as CM, is a pedagogical approach for teaching and learning music. It originated from the Young Composer Project (1959) and the Contemporary Music Project (1963), and was formally established at the Seminar on Comprehensive Musicianship held at Northwestern University in 1965. The two most notable examples of CM methodology are: the Manhattanville Music Curriculum Program (1965) and the Hawaii Music Curriculum Program (1968). In CM, students are the subject of learning, and they should learn comprehensively rather than memorize knowledge fragments. Moreover, they are required to pick up musical ability that can be applied in life situations (Thomson, 2021; Willoughby, 2021). These concepts largely conform to the new concepts in education.

The CM music curriculum in this study was based on the CM model endorsed by literature review, including integrating music elements, experiencing roles of

music, and activating learning strategies. Based on the Arts Domain in 12-Year Basic Education Curriculum Guidelines (Ministry of Education, 2018), the researcher designed three lessons under the Play Music by Hands Curriculum: music light show, kazoo DIY, and music composition with the expectation that the application of CM in practical teaching should present a music class that is well-rounded with diversity for the students. Based on the above research motivations, this study applies CM to the junior high school music curriculum, and the research objectives are as follows: (1) to design the music courses of the CM curriculum, (2) to standardize the pedagogical procedure for CM teachers, and (3) to analyze the learning performance of CM students.

The researcher is currently teaching a course on Music Pedagogy and Music Curriculum Theory in the music department and thus understands the difficulty which music majors face in applying theory in practice. To rectify this failure in the class, personal participation is required to explore the CM music curriculum. Through this action research, the researcher hopes to improve the personal teaching experience, reduce the gap between theory and practice, and provide college students with practical skills that are useful in the music classroom.

The researcher selected four music classes from Happy Junior High School (pseudonym) in the south of Taiwan taught by Beauty (pseudonym). To know the students better, the researcher participated in collaborative teaching with Beauty for two weeks prior to the beginning of the experiment. Then the researcher started a four-week CM curriculum of Play Music by Hands Curriculum from October 21 to November 20, 2020. Groups of 4 to 5 students were arranged to facilitate group discussion and performance in classroom settings. The classroom was equipped with an electric piano and projector for presentations.

Participants in this research included: a total of 116 seventh graders at junior high school, their music teacher, and the researcher. This study adopted the four cycles of action research, that is using the same in-class activities for four different classes. The first cycle was in class A, the second was in class B, the third was in class C, and the fourth was in class D. Content of the activities would be revised in

the classes conducted later to respond to the problems observed in the previous classes.

The data collected included quantitative and qualitative materials from students' questionnaires, teaching reflections, in-class records and videos. The student questionnaire, which has 15 quantitative and 9 qualitative questions, was reviewed by two experts for its validity; one of them is a professor in Department of Education of the National University of Tainan, and the other a junior high school music teacher.

The quantitative questions used a five-point Likert scale, with 5 denoting strongly agree, 4-agree, 3-neutral, 2-disagree, and 1 strongly disagree. For example, one of the questions is, "I like to watch my classmates performing the music light show" and students can pick 5 to 1 to express the degree of their predilection. The reliability of Cronbach's Alpha was .92, which indicates that the questionnaire has good reliability. In addition, the qualitative questions are open questions, in which students were asked to express their feelings and ideas in their own words. On top of students' feedback, the qualitative data also includes teaching reflections, in-class records, and videos. Triangulation was also utilized to present findings.

The main conclusions are as follows: First, the CM music curriculum emphasizes integrate musical elements, experiencing music roles, and diversifying learning strategies. Second, teachers who apply CM pay attention to allowing students sufficient time to explore, encouraging students' motivation to compose, and reinforcing class management to help students learn deeply. Third, CM students demonstrate greater motivation for learning, have better aesthetic experience, and acquire more application competencies.

In order not to interfere too much with the scheduled regular music instruction, this research limits the duration to only four weeks for each class and conducts CM for a total of four cycles. These two factors constitute the most significant limitation for the project. In the meantime, the CM music curriculum is to be revised through the course of the research and thus can be modified to improve the teaching quality and reduce the gap between theory and practice. Consequently, future researchers

can expand the scale of the experiment by implementing CM curriculum for an even longer duration. The experiment can be applied at different stages of education, such as preschool, elementary, and senior high school. Moreover, quantitative research methods can be used to probe into other factors related to the CM curriculum. The case study approach can also be adopted to examine contextual data in future studies.

Music encompasses a great variety of musical elements and musical experiences, which together constitute a tremendous array of learning, and thus should serve as the guideline for curriculum design. Teachers can use music to teach music and guide students to know what and why music is. With CM curriculum, students can enjoy the richness of music through active exploration, interaction, and the spirit of teamwork while at the same time invigorate their core competencies of autonomous action, communication and interaction, and social participation.

Keywords: Comprehensive Musicianship, music curriculum, teaching process, learning performance, action research

黃靜芳，國立臺灣師範大學音樂教育博士，現為國立臺南大學音樂學系兼任助理教授。主要研究領域為音樂心理學、音樂課程設計與音樂教學法。

Ching-Fang HUANG holds a PhD in Music Education from the National Taiwan Normal University. Presently, she is an adjunct assistant professor at the Department of Music of the National University of Tainan. Her research focuses on psychology of music, music curriculum design, and music pedagogy.