

大學音樂領域評比指標建構之初探

陳曉霽

摘要

近年來國際間各大學排名系統之評比結果漸受重視，成為高等教育重要的參考，然而部分領域卻因學科特性，至今仍欠缺具公信力之評比機制。國立臺灣師範大學有鑑於校內多元之特色領域，乃進行指標建置計畫，以結合音樂、藝術、運動與休閒三個學院在教學、研究、展演及比賽等方面之特點，建構特色領域之共同指標。本研究係計畫子項研究之一，首先探討國際評比系統，並從東亞教師教育國際聯盟及亞洲音樂校系中取樣，進行音樂校系特色分析，並初擬大學音樂領域評比指標。在初版指標形成後，遂以德懷術法向11位校外專家施以問卷調查，並透過多次校內會議完成指標訂定。研究結果獲致特色領域在聲譽20%、教學35%、研究/展演/比賽35%、國際化10%之共同構面與權重，及其對應之主指標及次指標，音樂領域之次指標則因學術與專業特色而與其他兩個學院有所不同。最後，本研究對評比指標後續之研究與實施提出建議。

關鍵詞：評比指標、音樂、大學排名、高等教育

*本篇文章為音樂教育領域，採用 APA 格式。

A Preliminary Study of Establishing University Ranking Indicators for the Field of Music

Hsiao-Fen CHEN

Abstract

University rankings have been gaining international attention in recent years, and have become an important reference for higher education. Some fields, however, lack a reliable system of indicators due to disciplinary peculiarities. National Taiwan Normal University (NTNU) endeavored to establish ranking system with appropriate indicators that are representative of the attributes specific to teaching, research, performance and competition within the colleges of music, arts, and sports and recreation. This study, as part of the university's overall project, aimed to establish ranking indicators for the field of music. In order to form a basis for the proposed indicators, the author first examined the current international ranking systems, analyzed the characteristics of music departments with selected samples from the International Consortium for Universities of Education in East Asia and selected conservatories in Asia, and proposed a tentative list of key indicators for the ranking of music departments and schools. The proposed indicators were tested by a survey conducted in the Delphi technique with 11 experts outside of NTNU. Further, numerous internal meetings were also held at NTNU for ongoing revisions. These results were used to create university-ranking indicators, which are comprised of four aspects weighted as: Reputation (20%), Teaching (35%), Research/Performances/Competitions (35%) and Internationalization (10%). Whereas each aspect has its own set of indicators and sub-indicators, those for the field of music should also differ slightly from the other two colleges due to the academic and professional features unique to the discipline. Lastly, this research offered suggestions for future research and implementation for a more well-rounded ranking system.

Keywords: ranking indicators, music, university rankings, higher education

參考文獻

英文

- Altbach, P. G. (2006). *The dilemmas of ranking*. Retrieved from <http://ejournals.bc.edu/ojs/index.php/ihe/article/viewFile/7878/7029>
- Art School Digital. (2013). *Art school digital*. Retrieved from <http://www.artschoolsdigital.com/>
- Clarke, M. (2002a). Quantifying quality: What can the U.S. News and World Report rankings tell us about the quality of higher education? *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 10(16). Retrieved from <http://epaa.asu.edu/ojs/article/view/295>
- Clarke, M. (2002b). Some guidelines for academic quality rankings. *Higher Education in Europe*, 17(4). Retrieved from http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTAFRREGTOPTEIA/Resources/acad_qual_rank_guide.pdf
- Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas. (2013). *Ranking web of universities*. Retrieved from <http://www.webometrics.info/>
- d'Hombres, B., & Saisana, M. (n.d.) *CRELL: Critiquing global university rankings and their methodologies*. Retrieved from <https://globalhighered.wordpress.com/2009/01/27/crell-critiquing-global-university-rankings-and-their-methodologies/>
- Hazelkorn, E. (2012). *Striving for world class excellence: Rankings and emerging societies*. Retrieved from <http://arrow.dit.ie/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1021&context=cserbk>
- Institute for Higher Education Policy. (2004). *International expert group created to improve higher education rankings*. Retrieved from <http://www.ireg-observatory.org/pdf/iregbriefhistory/IREG-1.pdf>
- Institute for Higher Education Policy. (2006). *Berlin principles on ranking of higher education institutions*. Retrieved from <http://www.ihep.org/research/publications/berlin-principles-ranking-higher-education-institutions>

- Oden, R. et al. (2007). *President's letters on college rankings*. Retrieved from http://apps.carleton.edu/trustees/assets/President_s_Ranking_Letters.pdf
- PhDs. org. (2013). *Ranking of music graduate schools*. Retrieved from <http://graduate-school.phds.org/rankings/music>
- Quacquarelli Symonds. (2013). *Top universities*. Retrieved from <http://www.topuniversities.com>
- Shanghai Jiao Tong University. (2013). *Academic ranking of world universities*. Retrieved from <http://www.shanghairanking.com/>
- Startclass. (2013). *Compare music schools*. Retrieved from <http://music-schools.startclass.com/>
- Steiner, J. E. (2006). *World university rankings-A principal component analysis*. Retrieved from <https://arxiv.org/ftp/physics/papers/0605/0605252.pdf>
- Students Review. (2013). *Students review*. Retrieved from <http://www.studentsreview.com/>
- The Complete University Guide. (2013). *University subject tables*. Retrieved from <http://www.thecompleteuniversityguide.co.uk/league-tables/rankings?s=Music>
- The Eduers.com. (2013). *Music department rankings*. Retrieved from http://www.eduers.com/Graduate/Graduate_School_Rankings_Music.html
- The Guardian University Guide (2013). *University guide 2013: League table for music*. Retrieved from <http://www.theguardian.com/education>
- Times Higher Education. (2013). *The world university rankings*. Retrieved from <http://www.timeshighereducation.co.uk>

中文

- 王保進 (1993)。高等教育表現指標之研究 (未出版之博士論文)。國立政治大學，臺北市。
- 【Wang, Bao-Jinn. (1993). *Performance Indicators of Higher Education*. (Unpublished PhD Dissertation). National Chengchi University, Taipei, Taiwan.】
- 王保進 (1996)。教育指標基本概念之分析。教育研究資訊，4(3)，1-18。
- 【Wang, Bao-Jinn. (1993). The Concept Analysis of Educational Indicators. *Educational Research & Information*. 4(3), 1-18.】

王保進、黃耀農（2004）。從標準到標竿：主要國家高等教育教育評鑑標準對我國的啟示。載於**教育評鑑回顧與展望學術研討會**（頁 95-115）。臺北市：國立臺灣師範大學教育研究中心。

【Wang, Bao-Jinn and Yao-Nong Huang. (2004). From Standard to Benchmark: What Can We Learn from the Evaluation of Higher Education in Major Countries? *Conference Proceeding for the Conference on the Retrospect and Prospect of Educational Evaluation*. 95-115. Taipei: NTNU Center for Educational Research.】

古雅瑄（2008）。美日大學分類與大學排名系統對我國高等教育發展之啟示。**學校行政**，**56**，1-13。

【Ku, Ya Hsuan. (2008). The Implication of University Classification and World University Ranking System for the Higher Education in Taiwan. *School Administration*. **56**, 1-13.】

李政翰（2006）。教育指標建構對教育發展重要性之探討。**研習資訊**，**23(5)**，107-110。

【Lee, Cheng-Han. (2006), A Study on the Significance for Constructing Educational Indicators to the Development of Education. *Inservice Education Bulletin*. **23(5)**, 107-110.】

吳清山（1999）。教育名詞：教育指標。**教育資料與研究**，**29**，67。

【Wu, Ching-Shan. (1999). Education Indicator. *Educational Resources and Research*. **29**, 67.】

吳清山、林天祐（2010）。從認可評鑑走向品質保證。載於吳清山（主編），**高等教育評鑑議題研究**（頁 179-189）。臺北市：高等教育。

【Wu, Ching-Shan, Tien-Yu Lin. (2010). From Accreditation to Quality Assurance. In Wu, Ching-Shan, ed. *A Study on Evaluation of Higher Education*. 179-189, Taipei: Higher Education.】

東亞教師教育國際聯盟（2013）。關於東亞教師教育聯盟。取自 <http://www.u-gakugei.ac.jp/~icue2009/cn/index.html>

【International Consortium for Universities of Education in East Asia. (2013). *International Consortium for Universities of Education in East Asia*. Retrieved from <http://www.u-gakugei.ac.jp/~icue2009/cn/index.html>】

林振春（1994）。**社會調查（第三版）**。臺北市：五南。

- 【Lin, Jenn-Chuen. (1994). *Social Research* (3rd). Taipei: Wunan.
- 林適湖 (2011)。臺灣高等教育之發展與省思。《教育資料集刊》，52，1-22。
- 【Lin, Shih-Hu. (2011). Reflections on the Development of Higher Education in Taiwan. *Bulletin of Educational Resources and Research*. 52, 1-22.】
- 周敦懿 (2007)。我國高等教育餐旅學門評鑑指標建構之研究 (未出版之博士論文)。國立臺灣師範大學，臺北市。
- 【Chou, Tun -Yi. (2007). *A Study of Specialized Program Evaluation Indicators for Undergraduate Hospitality Program*. (Unpublished PhD Dissertation). National Taiwan Normal University, Taipei, Taiwan.】
- 侯永琪 (2009)。全球與各國大學排名研究。臺北市：財團法人高等教育評鑑中心基金會。
- 【Ho, Yung-Chi. (2009). *A Study on the Global University Ranking*. Taipei: Higher Education Evaluation and Accreditation Council of Taiwan.】
- 財團法人高等教育評鑑中心基金會 (2010 年 9 月 15 日)。世界各大高等教育排名系統比較。取自
<http://www.heeact.edu.tw/public/Attachment/111110152523.pdf>
- 【Higher Education Evaluation and Accreditation Council of Taiwan. (2010). *A Comparative Study on Global University Rankers*. Retrieved from <http://www.heeact.edu.tw/public/Attachment/111110152523.pdf>】
- 教育部 (2008)。OECD 將以學習成效進行高等教育評比。《評鑑雙月刊》，11，62。
- 【Ministry of Education. (2008). The OECD is to Conduct Out-Come Based Evaluation for Higher Education. *Evaluation Bimonthly*. 11, 62.】
- 陳曼玲 (2007)。學界觀點：正視社會科學及人文學領域評比的必要性。《評鑑雙月刊》，5。取自 <http://epaper.heeact.edu.tw/archive/2007/01/08/150.aspx>
- 【Chen, Man-Ling. (2007). Academic Viewpoint: The Need for Evaluation for the Disciplines in Social Science and Humanities. *Evaluation Bimonthly*. 5. Retrieved from <http://epaper.heeact.edu.tw/archive/2007/01/08/150.aspx>】
- 張鈿富 (2008)。臺灣地區教育指標之研究。《教育研究資訊》，4(3)，18-40。
- 【Chang, Dian-Fu. (2008). A Study on Educational Indicators in Taiwan. *Educational Research & Information*. 4(3), 18-40.】
- 陸偉明 (1996)。簡介 QS-THES 大學排名系統。載於中興大學、長庚大學

(合編)，**大學國際化—我國高等教育論壇** (頁 75-86)。中興大學、長庚大學發行。

【Lu, Wei-ming. (1996). The QS-THES World University Rankings: An Introduction. In National Chung Hsing University and Chang Gung University ed., *University Internationalization: Taiwan Higher Education Forum*. 75-86.】

游家政 (1996)。得懷術及其在課程研究上的應用。 **花蓮師院學報**，**6**，1-24。

【Yu, Chia-Cheng. (1996). Delphi Technique and Its Application in Curriculum Study. *Journal of National Hualien Teachers College*. 6, 1-24.】

黃琬雅、白亦方 (2012)。大學藝術相關系所評鑑結果之分析。 **教育研究月刊**，**218**，51-59。

【Huang, Chu-Ya, Yi-Fang Bai. (2012). An Analytical Study on the Result of Accreditation for Art-Related Departments in Universities. *Journal of Education Research*. 218, 51-59.】

楊朝祥 (2009)。臺灣高等教育的挑戰、超越與卓越。 **教育資料集刊**，**44**，1-28。

【Yang, Chao-Hsiang. (2009). Taiwan Higher Education and the Challenges for the Good and the Excellence. *Bulletin of Educational Resources and Research*. 44, 1-28.】

楊朝祥、徐明珠 (2008)。臺灣高等教育指標國際化之比較研究。臺北市：國家政策研究基金會。取自 <http://www.npf.org.tw/2/4602>

【Yang, Chao-Hsiang, Ming-Chu Hsu. (2008) *A Comparative Study on Indicators for Internationalization of Higher Education in Taiwan*. Taipei: National Policy Foundation.】