

菲利克斯·孟德爾頌 《應答曲與讚美歌》中所展現的 宗教衝突與辯證

李昆穎

摘要

本文旨在討論菲利克斯·孟德爾頌（Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, 1809-1847）在其給男聲合唱、大提琴與低音大提琴的作品《應答曲與讚美歌》（*Responsorium et Hymnus*）中所展現對於不同宗教的態度。若從音樂學家斯波薩托（Jeffrey S. Sposato）對於該作曲家的身份認同所提出的論點來看，在此天主教儀式音樂創作中最後出現的路德教派聖詠，似乎是孟德爾頌對其路德新教信仰虔誠的展現以及對天主教的批判。然而若我們仔細地檢視該作品，便可以發現不同宗教所代表的音樂元素在其中展現了辯證式的關聯，因此菲利克斯並非是想要批評天主教，而是試圖表達不同宗教間共存的可能性與必要性，並同時呼應他的祖父摩西·孟德爾頌（Moses Mendelssohn, 1729-1786）所提出宗教多元與宗教寬容的觀點，認為此乃認識宗教真理的唯一途徑。在本文的最後，筆者認為對於孟德爾頌作品與生平在接受歷史，從華格納（Richard Wagner, 1813-1883）的反猶太主義到二十世紀後半所謂的孟德爾頌復興，也經歷了這樣的一個辯證歷程，因此我們必須持著多元的觀點，才能適當地理解與詮釋孟德爾頌的創作與生平。

關鍵詞：孟德爾頌、啟蒙運動、宗教多元、辯證、接受美學

Religious Conflicts and Dialectics in Felix Mendelssohn's *Responsorium et Hymnus*

Kwen-Yin LI

Abstract

This essay discusses the problem of Felix Mendelssohn's attitude towards different religions shown in his choral piece *Responsorium et Hymnus*, Op. 121, for male choir with cello and double bass. Musicologist Jeffrey S. Sposato argues that the insertion of the Lutheran chorale at the end of this Catholic liturgical work is a manifestation of the composer's devout Lutheran faith and a criticism against the Catholic church. However, with closer examination on the work, the author finds that Mendelssohn attempted to create a dialectic between different denominations of Christianity by using music elements which are representative of these denominations. Instead of a critique on Catholicism, Mendelssohn conveys the possibility and the necessity for the coexistence of different faiths, an idea which can be traced back to Moses Mendelssohn, the composer's grandfather, who suggests that religious pluralism and tolerance is the only way to religious truth. At the end of this paper, I propose that there is a parallel dialectic process in the reception history of Felix Mendelssohn's work and life—from the post-Wagnerian and anti-semitic criticism to the Mendelssohn Renaissance in the second half of 20th century. We cannot have comprehensive understanding and sound interpretation of Mendelssohn and his works without this multi-perspective approach.

Keywords: Felix Mendelssohn, Enlightenment, religious pluralism, dialectics, reception

參考文獻

一、樂譜

Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, Felix. *Adspice Domine. Vespergesang*. Edited by Günter Graulich. Stuttgart: Carus-Verlag, 1979.

二、書籍

Dyer, Joseph. "Roman Catholic Church Music." In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed., edited by Stanley Sadie, 21:544-570. London: Macmillan Publishers, 2001.

Emerson, John A., Jane Bellingham, and David Hiley. "Plainchant, 5: Style." In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd ed., edited by Stanley Sadie, 19:835-836. London: Macmillan Publishers, 2001.

Hensel, Sebastian, ed. *The Mendelssohn Family (1729-1847) from Letters and Journals*. Vol. 1. Translated by Carl Klingemann. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1882.

Hesbert, René-Jean, ed. *Corpus antiphonalium officii*. Vol. 4, *Responsoria, versus, hymni et varia*. Roma: Herder, 1970.

Konold, Wulf. *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy und seine Zeit*. Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1984.

Lessing, Gotthold Ephraim. *Nathan der Weise*. Berlin, 1779. Translated by Anastazy Kwiryn as *Natan Mędrzec* (Kraków: Fundacja Nowoczesna Polska, 2002).

Mintz, Donald. "1848, Anti-Semitism, and the Mendelssohn Reception." In *Mendelssohn Studies*, edited by R. Larry Todd, 126-148. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Poniatowski, Zygmunt. *Mały słownik religioznawczy*. Warsaw: Wiedza Powszechna, 1969.

- Reinbeck, Johann Gustav. *Betrachtungen über die in der Augspurgischen Confeßion enthaltene und damit verknüpfte Göttliche Wahrheiten*. Berlin: Haude, 1742.
- Rosen, Charles. *The Romantic Generation*. Boston: Harvard University Press, 1988.
- Schneider, Max F. *Mendelssohn oder Bartholdy? Zur Geschichte eines Familiennamens*. Basel: Internationale Felix-Mendelssohn-Gesellschaft, 1962.
- Todd, R. Larry. *Mendelssohn: A Life in Music*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- . *Mendelssohn Essays*. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Werner, Eric. *Mendelssohn: A New Image of the Composer and His Age*. Translated by Dika Newlin. New York: Free Press of Glencoe, 1963.
- . *Mendelssohn: Leben und Werk in neuer Sicht*. Zürich: Atlantis, 1980.
- Wood, Allen W. “Rational Theology, Moral Faith, and Religion.” In *The Cambridge Companion to Kant*, edited by Paul Guyer, 394-416. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

三、期刊

- Botstein, Leon. “Songs Without Words: Thoughts on Music, Theology, and the Role of the Jewish Question in the Work of Felix Mendelssohn.” *Musical Quarterly* 77, no. 4 (Winter 1993): 561-578.
- . “Mendelssohn and the Jews.” *Musical Quarterly* 82, no. 1 (Spring 1998): 210-219.
- . “Notes from the Editor: Mendelssohn as Jew: Revisiting Controversy on the Occasion of the Composer’s 200th Birthday.” *Musical Quarterly* 92, no. 1-2 (Spring-Summer 2009): 1-8.
- Cherniak, Judith. “Mendelssohn Reconsidered.” *Musical Times* 154, no. 1922 (Spring 2013): 45-55.
- Gottlieb, Michah. “Mendelssohn’s Metaphysical Defense of Religious Pluralism.” *Journal of Religion* 86, no. 2 (April 2006): 205-225.

- Li, Kwen-Yin. “Spór i dialektyka wyznań religijnych w *Responsorium et Hymnus* Felixa Mendelssohna.” *Kwartalnik Młodych Muzykologów UJ*, no. 37 (2018): 101-124. Accessed November 4, 2018. <http://www.ejournals.eu/kmmuj/2018/Numer-37/art/12143/>.
- . “Conflict and Dialectic of Faiths in Felix Mendelssohn’s *Responsorium et Hymnus*.” *Kwartalnik Młodych Muzykologów UJ*, English issues, no. 37 (2018): 101-123. Accessed November 4, 2018. <http://www.ejournals.eu/kmmuj/English-Issues/Issue-37/art/12488/>.
- Sorkin, David. “The Case for Comparison: Moses Mendelssohn and the Religious Enlightenment.” *Modern Judaism* 14, no. 2 (May 1994): 121-138.
- Sposato, Jeffrey S. “Creative Writing: The [Self-] Identification of Mendelssohn as Jew.” *Musical Quarterly* 82, no. 1 (Spring 1998): 190-209.
- . “Mendelssohn, “Paulus,” and the Jews: A Response to Leon Botstein and Michael Steinberg.” *Musical Quarterly* 83, no. 2 (Summer 1999): 280-291.
- Steinberg, Michael P. “Mendelssohn’s Music and German-Jewish Culture: An Intervention,” *Musical Quarterly* 83, no. 1 (Spring 1999): 31-44.
- Todd, R. Larry and Angela R. Mace. “Mendelssohn and the Free Chorale.” *Choral Journal* 49, no. 9 (March 2009): 48-69.

四、影音

- Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, Felix. *Mendelssohn Church Music*. Recorded with St. John’s College Choir, Cambridge. Conducted by Christopher Robinson. Nimbus NI5529, 1997. CD.
- . *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy: Motetten*. Recorded with Münchner Hofkantorei. Conducted by Wolfgang Antesberger. Solo Musica SM128, 2010. CD.
- . *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy: Werke für Chor und Orgel*. Recorded with Ryoko Morooka (organ) and Norddeutscher Figuralchor. Conducted by Jörg Straube. Thorofon CTH2567, 2011. CD.